

IJOLAE 9948

by Artikel Ijolae 9948

Submission date: 05-Mar-2020 02:08PM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 1269709539

File name: 9948-26982-1-RV_1.doc (297.5K)

Word count: 3470

Character count: 18218

Enhancing Critical Thinking in Analyzing Short story "The Lazy Jack" viewed from Identity Theory**Moh. Yamin****Faculty of Education and Teacher Training, Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Indonesia**

DOI: xxx

Received: January 1st, 2019. Revised: January 8th, 2019. Accepted: January 15th, 2019Available Online: January 20th, 2019. Published Regularly: January 1st, 2019**Abstract**

This paper aims to describe and discuss the messages and meanings of the short story "The Lazy Jack". The significance of this research is for building new frame that analyzing literary work is only viewed from the setting or character in simple manner, but also can be viewed from identity theory assisted with critical thinking as the thinking approach rationally and based on the reason; reason is based on the researchers' capacity in deepening and learning the situations and conflict happening to the character in the story. It is qualitative research in which the data collection is started from coding obtained from the text "The Lazy Jack" in line with the goal of the research. From the result of data collection through coding, every findings show that Jack does not have the firm personal identity, firm life principle, life vision, and struggling for survival. He is the one dependent on others although he himself always fails to learn to be better. It means that Jack is without personal and social identity.

Keywords: Critical Thinking, Identity, and The Lazy Jack*Corresponding Author: Moh. Yamin**Faculty of Education and Teacher Training, Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Indonesia**E-mail: moh_yamin@ulm.ac.id***1. Introduction**

Identity in literary work can be reflected from the characters narrated in the story. Identity exhibits how the characters appear in every part of the story. Identity theory (Stryker, Sheldon & Burke, 1980; Layder, 2004) meets in two goals:

- 1) Understanding and explaining how social structures impact self;
- 2) Understanding and explaining how self impacts social behaviors.

In understanding that context, it is very necessary to get the detail explanation on how identity should be viewed to be able to comprehend and analyze the identity of characters in a story (Stryker, 1968; Wells, L. Edward and Stryker, 1988) and it is explained as follows:

- 1) Social roles are expectations attached to positions occupied in networks of relationships; identities are internalized role expectations;

- 2) Identity salience is defined as the probability that an identity will be invoked across a variety of situations, or, alternatively, as the differential probability across persons that an identity will be invoked in a given situation.

What can be detail explanation is that model for identity theory is (Burke, 1991; Burke & Tully, 1977) formulated into the following:

- 1) The identity standard, or the set of (culturally prescribed) meanings held by the individual defining their role identity in a situation;
- 2) Perceptions by the person of meanings within the situation matched to the dimensions of meaning in the identity standard;

Personality as identity is the other form explaining that identity should be viewed as the self identity. In Freud' view,

even personality development is intervened by id, ego, and superego. The id is defined as the seat of drives and instincts (a throwback to the original drive model), whereas the ego represents the logical, reality-oriented part of

the mind, and the superego is akin to a conscience, or set of moral guidelines and prohibitions (Fancher, 1998). Here is the model used in identity of the characters:

Neo-Analytic Models of Personality

Theorist	Key Assumption	Key Assumption
Adler	Family dynamics (especially birth order) are primary determinants of personality.	Striving for superiority, inferiority complex
Erikson	Social interactions between individual and significant others are key in personality development.	Psychosocial stages, developmental crises
Fromm	Personality is best understood with reference to prevailing social and political (as well as intrapsychic) forces.	Authoritarianism
Horney	Infantile dependency-powerlessness is key to personality.	Basic anxiety
Jung	Personality is shaped by spiritual forces as well as by biological and social variables.	Archetypes, collective unconscious
Sullivan	Personality can only be conceptualized within the context of an individual's core relationships.	Personifications, developmental epochs

In understanding personal identity through identity theory, it is very important to pay attention critical thinking as thinking framework so that identity theory used can be assisted with the critical thinking existence. Critical thinking is evaluating whether we should be convinced that some claim is true or some argument is good, as well as formulating good arguments (Epstein, 2006). In critical thinking, anyone is required to be able to show one's belief that what he or she thinks and says is believable and convincing.

Critical thinking is related to both deeper and higher order thinking. It is a process of considering a topic or problem from multiple perspectives and focuses on achieving a particular outcome/resolution or simply to better understand all aspects of an issue. It

Source: (Bornstein, 2003) may challenge established beliefs or prior knowledges and can provoke further questions or areas to explore/research (Bahr, 2010). It means that in critical thinking, the approach used in thinking should be based on the self capacity to participate in contextual meaning completed with the prior knowledge. Consequently, there should be output gained from thinking process. Thinking in critical thinking should be based on logical reason in which there should be started from thesis, anti-thesis, and synthesis (Limnatis, 2010).

Golding (2011) views critical thinking a thinking-encouraging approach where the it is important to scaffold students to think for themselves, rather than leading them to understand a body of knowledge. It is done, based on isolating and articulating critical

thinking by ‘reverse engineering’ the questions expert critical thinkers ask. The result of using this method is that students will be immersed in the practice of making critical judgements where they will hone their critical skills, cultivate a critical character and begin to speak, act and think like expert critical thinkers. Therefore, cultivating critical thinking to students as the example is the description how critical thinking could be practiced.

The fundamental purpose of the function of thinking is to attribute meaning to events in our lives, classify these events into categories and identify them subjectively. Individuals who can effectively utilise critical thinking in their lives are individuals who possess the skills and disposition necessary for critical thinking. Critical thinking is an important cognitive skill which affects students’ viewpoints on events, their perceptions concerning what transpires in their environment and their decision-making processes (Tosuncuoglu, 2018). It means that critical thinking is needed as thinking framework in responding towards any issues or problems.

Because this paper was aimed to enhance critical thinking in analyzing short story ‘‘The Lazy Jack’’ viewed from identity theory, so this concept was used to help identity theory in finding out the messages and meanings expressed in such short story. The significance is that it gives new perspective dealing with critical thinking combined with identity theory as the approach in analyzing literary work.

Hopefully, its practice enriches state of the art.

2. Method

It is a qualitative research in which the research was conducted by taking the data from a short story entitled ‘‘The Lazy Jack’’, a story describing a character known as the person who is lazy. The character of lazy towards the character was illustrated as the one who never thinks before acting or deciding to do something.

In conducting the data collection, it was started from coding in which coding was functioned to sign every data considered important to note so that the data collection was rigidly done. Coding was done to make easy the next step that was called categorizing in which categorizing aimed to make subcoding based on the data needed. Therefore, categorizing is a part of coding done in data collection. Because the goal of paper was oriented to obtain the messages and meanings expressed in the story, the data collection was focused on the paper goal. The data collected were interpreted based on the paper goal as the final step of coding. The coding used in this paper was manual coding (Saldana, 2013). Therefore, it used the researcher’s knowledge in analyzing the text. Through critical thinking combined with identity theory as the knowledge capital, the researcher worked in analyzing the short story.

3. Result and Discussion

1 ONCE upon a time there was a boy whose name was Jack. Jack lived with his mother. They were very poor, and the old woman made her living by spinning. But Jack was so lazy that he did nothing but lie in the sun in the hot weather in the summer, and sit by the fire-place in the winter. So people called him Lazy Jack.

His mother could not make him work. At last one Monday she said to him!

"If you don't begin to work for your porridge, I will turn you out of the house."

These words made Jack do something.

Figure 1. Jack with His Identity

2 Jack in figure 1 is dominated by the id, defined as the seat of drives and instincts (a throwback to the original drive model). His life performance does not show the effort to change the life better. His poor economy does not drive him to do change effort what to do. He enjoys the life and accepts the reality given although it does not contribute towards the better life.

Jack declares him as a child although he is not a child. The seat of drives and instincts embrace him so that he does not feel that he is not a child.

In the Sigmund Freud's theory (Fancher, 1998), he is in unconsciousness dealing with who he is and what he is. He is conscious after his mother threatens him. His consciousness appears because of external factor. Sullivan says that Jack's consciousness be conceptualized within the context of an individual's core relationships. Jung mentions that personality is shaped by spiritual forces as well as by biological and social variables. Jack as the person characterized as the lazy person appears not to do anything to change his behaviour.

17 So on Tuesday, he went out and hired himself for a day to a neighboring farmer for a penny. But when he was going home in the evening, he lost the penny.

"You silly boy," said his mother, "you should have put it in your pocket."

"I'll do so another time." answered Jack.

Figure 2. Jack with His Identity

Jack as shown in figure 2 is the one categorized hopeless identity. When rising up, it is driven by id Horney includes him as the person with infantile dependency-powerlessness and in basic anxiety. He is not independent, not tough in struggling for life.

In identity theory usage, social roles are expectations attached to positions occupied in networks of relationships; identities are internalized role expectations (Stryker, 1968; Wells, L. Edward and Stryker, 1988). Jack in this position is weak in interaction.

He does not know what to do with the penny he holds. Jack is categorized as the person who is alone in his environment and never does the effort to make him better. Jack characterized as the hopeless person is the explanation that he does not have life vision what to do. His identity is no identity. His identity reflects his zero knowledge how to start to interact with the other. What Jack shows in his activity is his reflection on how he does the life. It is meant that Jack is the one who does not know who he is actually.

On Wednesday, Jack went out again and hired himself to a cowman. The cowman gave him a jar of milk for his day's work. Jack took the jar of milk and put it into the large pocket of his jacket. But the milk was all spilled long before he got home.

"Oh! You should have carried it on your head," said the old woman.
"I'll do so another time," answered Jack.

Figure 3. Jack with His Identity

The same mistake foolish reappears towards Jack shown in figure 3 in which he does not have knowledge to differentiate jar of milk and pocket. Again, he is mastered by the id, defined as the seat of drives and instincts (a throwback to the original drive model). What he sees is perceived right to use although it is wrong. Burke (1991) mentions that what Jack performs is result of self perception what he sees and considers right according to his perception. Therefore, the same mistake foolish done by Jack is the reality of Jack's character.

This is in line with Olson and Maio's view (2003) that attitudes do not exist in isolation from each other or from other

constructs. For example, people who favor social assistance payments to the poor may on average possess positive attitudes toward other social welfare programs such as national health care and subsidized housing. The positive attitudes toward all of these programs may in turn arise because the person attaches high importance to the social value of helpfulness. Such relations among attitudes and values may have implications for stability and change in attitudes. In this section, we consider how attitudes are structurally and functionally related to each other and how sets of attitudes may be related to higher-order constructs such as values and ideologies.

On Thursday, Jack hired himself again to a farmer. In the evening the farmer gave him a large soft cheese for his work. Jack took the cheese and went home with it on his head. By the time he got home the cheese was all spoilt. He lost part of it, and part of it was in his hair.

"You foolish boy," said the mother, "you should have carried it very carefully in your hands." "I'll do so another time," answered Jack.

Figure 4. Jack with His Identity

It is the same mistake in figure 4 that Jack actually is the person genre who does not have independence and knowledge. In identity theory, Jack does not know how to use and what to use. Again, he is blank with what he faces. Id dominates his life. The thing to remember is that Jack seems not having the capacity to change his habit.

Jack is the one who is always busy with himself so that such condition pushes him not to make him better in self personalization. Jack with his character that is not open with outside world teaching life dynamics causes him left behind in doing any adaptations and assimilations (Bornstein, 2003).

9 On Friday, Lazy Jack again went out and hired himself to a baker. The baker gave him nothing for his work but a large cat. Jack took the cat, and began to carry it very carefully in his hands, but in a short time the cat scratched him so much that he let it go. When he got home, his mother said to him:



"You silly boy, you should have tied a string to it, and dragged it along after you."
"I'll do so another time," answered Jack.

Figure 5. Jack with His Identity

19 Burke mentions the identity standard, or the set of (culturally prescribed) meanings held by the individual defining their role identity in a situation. Jack in this case cannot position himself as the person what he has to do. It is in line what From (Bornstein, 2003) says dealing with infantile dependency-powerlessness and basic anxiety.

Jack is positioned as the unstable person because he psychologically does not have principle in determining himself what to do. Jack is anxious what to do and how he thinks and acts. Consequently, he is in bad situation in which Jack puts himself as the person in questioning.

19 Oshman & Manosevitz, (1974) state that one's identity is determined based on how the person performs and does interaction with other. One's identity is the reflection on who the one position himself and to others as a social creature. It means that in identity formation, there should be self affirmation that the one is stable in psychological aspect so that this condition supports the one's identity for himself and for ther others. Jack in this context as the character in the story is told as the one who is undergoing identity crisis in which he does not know what he does and how to do with anything happening to him.

1 On Saturday, Jack hired himself to a butcher, who gave him a shoulder of mutton for his work. Jack took the mutton, tied a string to it, and dragged it along after him. By the time he got home, the meat was quite spoilt.

14 This time his mother was very angry, for the next day was Sunday, and she had only cabbage for Sunday dinner.

"You foolish boy," said she to her son, "you should have carried it on your shoulder."
"I'll do so another time," answered Jack.

Figure 6. Jack with His Identity

Jack in figure 6 is blank what to do with the mutton he got from a buthcer as the compensation. He considers mutton the thing tied and dragged. In his weak capacity dealing with mutton raw material, Jack is cate-

gorized as the person with Infantile dependency-powerlessness, basic anxiety. In Horney's view, his perfomance foolish is the self reflection that he is no identity (Bornstein, 2003).

It is the irony for Jack in which he seems not using his mind to be able to think logically. It means that Jack is Jack who is foolish because of his behavior not to learn from his mother's advice. He has undergone identity crisis for himself as the person unstable¹⁰

Personal identity consists in non-branching psychological connectedness and continuity. There is psychological connectedness when a person remembers doing or experiencing something that someone earlier did or experienced, or when a person's intention to do something leads to

its later being done, or when psychological states, such as beliefs and desires, persist over time (Martin, 1988).

What Martin said means that Jack does not have personal identity. Jack is not grouped in personal identity that has goal and target in as much as whatever Jack does always creates anger from his mother. Every action Jack does makes his mother angry and disappointed so that this condition produces identity crisis for Jack himself as the character narrated in the story. Jack is positioned meaningless towards himself illustrated in the story.

¹ On the next Monday, Lazy Jack again went out, and hired himself to a cattle keeper, who gave him a donkey for his work. Jack put the donkey on his shoulders and began to walk⁸ slowly home. Now it happened that on his way home he passed the house of a rich man. This man had an only daughter, who was a beautiful girl, but she was deaf and dumb. She had never laughed in her life, and the doctors said she would never speak till somebody made her laugh.

Figure 7. Jack with His Identity

In the second paragraph in figure 7, it is said that Jack's foolish performance is considered herb for the one with deaf and dumb. It is actually satire stating that only those with no brains will be successful persons. In other words, dream comes true if it is reached through working hard and working with intelligence.

Erikson in Bornstein (2003) says that social interactions between individual and others are key in personality development. Jack seems not having good interaction with other people so that he is not motivated to be a better person. He considers himself as the person who has enough knowledge what to do although he always makes the same mistakes in everything what he does.



¹⁶ Now it happened that this young lady was looking out of the window when Jack was passing with the donkey on his shoulders. The sight was so funny and strange that she burst out laughing and at once found that she could hear and speak.

Figure 8. Jack with His Identity

It is also satire narrating Jack's performance shown in figure 8 and it is said to be herb for the one with deaf and dumb to be able to hear and speak. It is only imagined identity teaching us to be human beings with ego and super ego in order not to be laughed because of our strange and foolish performances.

What is shown in figure 8 is only imaginative example in which it does not describe the real thing. The foolishness behaviour performed by Jack in **1** series of events teaches the life wisdom. When Jack was passing with the donkey on his shoulders narrated in the story is called giving herb for the one with deaf and dumb to be able to hear and speak, it is the satire in which it suggests us not to be foolish like Jack in doing the life.

What is described in figure 8 is not the self identity of Jack, but a failure in describing his identity as the person or character in a story. It is no matter that Jack is lazy, but it can be a problem in framing and building identity when Jack always puts himself as the person who never learns from the experience. Therefore, self identity of Jack does not represent his himselfness. What happens to Jack is explained by Stets and Burke (2003) that Jack in every series of actions in different situations never moves to be better in performing his behaviour.

Based on all discussions from all findings, it is very important to use critical thinking in assisting identity theory in analyzing the literary work. Critical thinking used in analyzing short story "The Lazy Jack" through identity theory has contributed towards the deep analysis of the literary work. Therefore, Jack described in the story is the character without having firm life principle, life vision, and struggling for survival. He is the one dependent on others although he himself always fails to learn to be better.

4. Conclusion

Jack based on his life story can be categorized as the person without identity. His

identity as personal and social creature is doubtful because from every his life way from day to day told in the story, Jack always is the unluck person. When he will be lucky, his luck is blocked by his foolish behavior and action.

Jack is analogized as the character who never stops to do the same mistake and foolish although it harms him; other people laugh at and mock him.

5. References

- Bahr, N. (2010). Thinking Critically about Critical Thinking in Higher Education. *International Journal for the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning*, 4(2).
<https://doi.org/10.20429/ijstl.2010.040209>
- Bornstein, R. F. (2003). Psychodynamic Models of Personality. In M. J. Millon Theodore & Lerner (Ed.), *Handbook of Psychology*. New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Burke, P. J. (1991). Identity Processes and Social Stress. *American Sociological Association*, 56(6), 836–849.
<https://doi.org/10.1002/9781405165518.wbeosa047.pub2>
- Burke, P. J., & Tully, J. C. (1977). The measurement of role identity. *Social Forces*, 55(4), 881–897.
<https://doi.org/10.1093/sf/55.4.881>
- Epstein, R. L. (2006). *Critical Thinking* (Third). Belmont, CA: Thomson Wadsworth.
- Fancher, R. E. (1998). The Origin and Development of Psychoanalysis. *American Journal of Psychology*, 21, 1–42.
- Golding, C. (2011). Educating for critical thinking: Thought-encouraging questions in a community of inquiry. *Higher Education Research and Development*, 30(3), 357–370.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/07294360.2010.499144>
- Layder, D. (2004). *Social and Personal Identity: Understanding Yourself*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

- Limnatis, E. by N. G. (Ed.). (2010). *The Dimensions of Hegel's Dialectic*. New York: continuum.
<https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781107415324.004>
- Martin, R. (1988). Identity's crisis. *Philosophical Studies*, 53, 295–307.
- Olson, James M. & Maio, G. R. (2003). Attitudes in Social Behavior. In M. J. Millon Theodore & Lerner (Ed.), *Handbook of Psychology*. New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Oshman, H., & Manosevitz, M. (1974). The impact of the identity crisis on the adjustment of late adolescent males. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 3(3), 207–216.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02214750>
- Saldana, J. (2013). *The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers* (2nd ed.). London: SAGE.
- Stets, J. E., & Burke, P. J. (2003). A sociological approach to self and identity. In M. L. and J. Tangney (Ed.), *Handbook of Self and Identity* (pp. 128–152). Guilford Press. Retrieved from <http://wat2146.ucr.edu/papers/02a.pdf>
- Stryker, Sheldon & Burke, P. J. (1980). *The Past, Present, and Future of an Identity Theory*.
- Stryker, S. (1968). Identity Salience and Role Performance. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 4, 558–564.
- Tosuncuoglu, I. (2018). English language and literature students' perceptions of critical thinking. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 7(5), 20–28.
<https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v7n5p20>
- Wells, L. Edward and Stryker, S. (1988). Stability and Change in Self over the Life Course. In and R. M. L. P. B. Bates, D. L. Featherman (Ed.), *Life-Span Development and Behavior* (pp. 191–299). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.

ORIGINALITY REPORT

30%

SIMILARITY INDEX

25%

INTERNET SOURCES

14%

PUBLICATIONS

12%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	fairytalez.com Internet Source	5%
2	mafiadoc.com Internet Source	3%
3	fkip.ums.ac.id Internet Source	3%
4	files.eric.ed.gov Internet Source	2%
5	www.tandfonline.com Internet Source	2%
6	Gregory R. Maio, James M. Olson, Irene Cheung. "Attitudes in Social Behavior", Wiley, 2012 Publication	2%
7	wat1203.ucr.edu Internet Source	2%
8	www.hasanboy.uz Internet Source	2%

9	www.onlineaudiostories.com Internet Source	2%
10	Raymond Martin. "Identity's crisis", Philosophical Studies, 1988 Publication	1%
11	digitalcommons.georgiasouthern.edu Internet Source	1%
12	www.journalijar.com Internet Source	1%
13	Robert F. Bornstein. "Psychodynamic Models of Personality", Wiley, 2003 Publication	1%
14	www.lds.org Internet Source	1%
15	www.bsc.edu Internet Source	1%
16	www.ency123.com Internet Source	<1%
17	www.takshilalearning.com Internet Source	<1%
18	Submitted to Grimsby College, South Humberside Student Paper	<1%
19	Submitted to Transylvania University	

<1%

20

Submitted to College of Professional and Continuing Education (CPCE), Polytechnic University

Student Paper

<1%

21

trepo.tuni.fi

Internet Source

<1%

22

Clinton Golding. "Educating for critical thinking: thought-encouraging questions in a community of inquiry", Higher Education Research & Development, 2011

Publication

<1%

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches Off

Exclude bibliography On

IJOLAE 9948

GRADEMARK REPORT

FINAL GRADE

/0

GENERAL COMMENTS

Instructor

PAGE 1

PAGE 2

PAGE 3

PAGE 4

PAGE 5

PAGE 6

PAGE 7

PAGE 8

PAGE 9
